Title: Regarding appointment of Shri P.S. Subramaniyam,as Chairman of Unit Trust of India.

14.14 hrs.

...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI PRIYA RANJAN DASMUNSI (RAIGANJ): Mr. Speaker, Sir, I have a very important matter to bring to your notice and the notice of the whole House....(*Interruptions*)â€¦For the last two days I have been giving notice to raise it....(*Interruptions*)â€¦The Finance Minister may kindly be present for a minute.

MR. SPEAKER: I have not yet started the 'Zero Hour.'

Is it a 'Zero Hour' matter?

SHRI PRIYA RANJAN DASMUNSI : Yes, Sir...(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Kunwar Akhilesh Singh, please take your seat. When your turn comes, you will get a chance to raise your matter.

...(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: If you allow, we may take up the 'Zero Hour'.

...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI PRIYA RANJAN DASMUNSI : Sir, through you, I would like to draw the kind attention of the Government. Our distinguished Member of this House and the former Minister...(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Shri Priya Ranjan Dasmunsi, please clarify to me. This subject matter is before the JPC for examination.

SHRI PRIYA RANJAN DASMUNSI : No, Sir. It is not with the JPC. It is a current matter. It is a very important matter...(*Interruptions*)

Sir, I would like to draw the attention of the House to that issue.

MR. SPEAKER: It is the subject matter of the JPC.

SHRI PRIYA RANJAN DASMUNSI : No. It is not the subject matter of the JPC. The distinguished Member of this House, the former Union Defence Minister and the Convenor of the NDA, had made a direct allegation about the conduct or functioning of the Prime Minister in a statement. ...(*Interruptions*) What is this? ...(*Interruptions*)

श्री विजय गोयल (चांदनी चौक) : सर, जेपीसी बैठी हुई है। इसको बार-बार उठाने का क्या औचित्य है। आप न्यूज-पेपर देख लीजिए, माननीय जयपाल रेड्डी जी ने खुद कहा है।â€¦(व्यवधान)

श्री शीशराम सिंह रवि (बिजनौर) : इस पर चर्चा हो चुकी है, दुबारा इस पर चर्चा की क्या आवश्यकता है। ...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI PRIYA RANJAN DASMUNSI : Sir, there is an established practice in the Government that high level appointments will be made by the Appointments Committee of the Cabinet based on rules and procedures. Here, a distinguished Member of this House made a public accusation that the leader of the AIADMK, Ms. Jayalalithaa who was earlier an ally of the previous Government headed by Shri Vajpayee, sent a written letter to the Prime Minister, and based on that letter, the Prime Minister appointed Shri Subramanyam as the Chairman of the UTI. ...(*Interruptions*) Sir, this is a serious charge about the functioning of the Prime Minister and his Office. ...(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: The JPC is examining the entire matter of the UTI. You can raise it in the JPC also. What is this? Why are you doing it here?

...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI PRIYA RANJAN DASMUNSI : Sir, I demand that the letter of Ms. Jayalalithaa to the Prime Minister should be passed on to the Joint Parliamentary Committee forthwith. ...(*Interruptions*) The Prime Minister owes an explanation to the House about his conduct. ...(*Interruptions*) May I know whether the Prime Minister, based on pressures from the allies, appoints Chairmen of Boards like this? ...(*Interruptions*) Sir, it is not a simple thing. ...(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Shri Ajoy Chakraborty.

...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI PRIYA RANJAN DASMUNSI : Sir, there are 24 partners in this coalition Government. If, on the basis of the recommendation of allies, the Prime Minister appoints one person after another, then I feel that the House has the right to know the method of operation of the Prime Minister. ...(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Shri Ajoy Chakraborty.

...(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Nothing should go on record except Shri Ajoy Chakraborty.

*(Interruptions)**

MR. SPEAKER: No. I am not going to allow anybody.

...(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Nothing should go on record.

(Interruptions) *

SHRI P.H. PANDIAN (TIRUNELVELI): Sir, I have to reply to that. I will reply in a minute. Sir, my leader Ms. Jayalalithaa has categorically denied that statement and, said that she did not know Shri Subramanyam and that she had not recommended his name. My leader has categorically denied that statement. ...(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Nothing should go on record.

(Interruptions) *

SHRI P.H. PANDIAN : Sir, please give me one minute to reply to that. I must reply to that. ...(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Today, more than 38 hon. Members have given notices to raise issues during 'Zero Hour'. Please understand that.

...(*Interruptions*)

* Not Recorded

SHRI P.H. PANDIAN : Sir, I will have to reply to that. It is concerning the Chief Minister of Tamil Nadu. ...(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Is there anything from the Government's side?

...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI P.H. PANDIAN : Sir, my leader has categorically denied that statement and said that she did not know Shri

Subramanyam. ...(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: You are not allowing the Minister to speak. Shri PANDIAN, there is nothing for you to reply.

...(*Interruptions*)

THE MINISTER OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS AND MINISTER OF INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY (SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN): You may first go back to your seat. You do not know where to stand in the House....(*Interruptions*) There is some procedure in the House....(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Shri Selvaganapathi, please go to your seat. Shri Pappu Yadav, you may also go to your seat.

...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN: Even Shri PANDIAN is not sitting in his own seat....(*Interruptions*)

SHRI P.H. PANDIAN : I am elected to Lok Sabha by a Party. My leader's name has been dragged into this. Am I not entitled to reply?â€¦ (*Interruptions*) My leader, Dr. Jayalalitha, has categorically denied saying that she does not know Shri Subhramanyam and that she had not recommended his name. It has been stated by the Minister of Finance in the Rajya Sabha that a sub-Committee had appointed Shri Subhramanyam and that his appointment was not made on the recommendation of Dr. Jayalalitha, the Chief Minister of Tamil Nadu....(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Nothing should go on record.

*(Interruptions)**

** Not Recorded*

MR. SPEAKER: Nothing should go on record except the Minister's reply.

*(Interruptions)**

MR. SPEAKER: Shri Adhi Sankar, please go to your seat first. How can you raise a matter from here?

SHRI RASHID ALVI (AMROHA): I may be given an opportunity to speak....(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Nothing should go on record.

*(Interruptions)**

श्री प्रमोद महाजन : अध्यक्ष महोदय, मैंने जो सुनने की कोशिश की है, उसके अनुसार इस सदन के माननीय सदस्य श्री प्रियरंजन दासमुंशी ने इस सदन के सम्माननीय सदस्य श्री जॉर्ज फर्नान्डीज द्वारा इस सदन के बाहर दिये गये किसी बयान के बारे में जिक्र किया है। मेरा कहना है कि लोक सभा में काम-काज करने का जो नियम है, उसके अंतर्गत मैं नियम-40 को उद्धृत करना चाहता हूं :

> "A question may be addressed to a Private Member provided the subject matter of the question deals withâ€¦.. "

Then, a few subjects have been mentioned. मेरा यह कहना है कि if one Member has to ask some question to another Member, as in this case Shri Dasmunsi has to, under this Rule he should give a notice to Shri George Fernandes, who in turn will answer his question. How does the Government come into this?...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI PRIYA RANJAN DASMUNSI : It is the responsibility of the Government....(*Interruptions*) It is a direct allegation against the Prime Minister....(*Interruptions*)

SHRI CHANDRA SHEKHAR (BALLIA, U.P.): Shri Dasmunsi has not raised a question about a particular Member. It raises the basic question of the functioning of the Government, whether the Government acts on the advice of the people from outside or takes its decisions according to the rules and norms that are there for the functioning of any Cabinet form of Government.

* Not Recorded

We understand that so far important appointments have been made by the Appointment Committee. But here, the convenor of the NDA says that this appointment was made on the recommendation of a particular individual. It creates doubts about the whole functioning of the Government and the Government is responsible to this House to clarify this matter. The Minister cannot refuse it under Rule 40. He reads rules every day. But this is the basic question....(*Interruptions*)

SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN: Please see the rule.

SHRI CHANDRA SHEKHAR : I do not read the rules. I have never read the rules. But I have more experience of parliamentary life than you have got and in parliamentary life, it is the decency, decorum, dignity, rules, and traditions that operate...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI P.H. PANDIAN : Sir, let the Minister of Finance come forward with a statement....(*Interruptions*)

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE (BOLPUR): Sir, I think what the hon. Member has raised is not a clarification...(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: It is a pity that you are not allowing other Members to raise important matters in the House. That is the problem.

...(*Interruptions*)

श्री विजय गोयल : सर, इस पर सोमनाथ दादा कैसे बोलने के लिए खड़े हो गये। यह जीरो ऑवर है। इसमे श्री प्रियरंजन जी ने बात रखी, उसका जवाब मिल गया â€¦(व्यवधान) यह ज्यादती है। हमारा भी मैटर है, हमारी भी कांस्टीटुएंसी है, वहां की भी समस्याएं हैं।â€¦(व्यवधान)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : आपको भी बुलायेंगे।

श्री विजय गोयल : इस पर बहस नहीं हो सकतीâ€¦(व्यवधान)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : आपको भी बुलायेंगे। You have to understand the agony of other Members.

...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE : Sir, important issues are raised. I do not know why I cannot speak...(*Interruptions*) Sir, I will hardly take half a minute...(*Interruptions*)

डॉ.रमेश चन्द तोमर (हापुड़) : सर, इस पर डिस्कशन नहीं हो रहा है, यह क्यों बोल रहे हैं।â€¦(व्यवधान)

SHRI P.H. PANDIAN : Sir, the Minister of Finance stated in the Rajya Sabha that the sub-committee had appointed him....(*Interruptions*)

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE : Mr. Speaker, Sir, the issue is very fundamental...(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Shri Rudy, please take your seat.

...(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: I have your names with me. I will call you.

...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI RAJIV PRATAP RUDY (CHHAPRA): Sir, we come in the morning and wait for this occasion to present our views...(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: I am appealing you to please take your seat.

...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE : Sir, I would have concluded by this time. Sir, the trouble is that I find at this age of my career that we have got too many `Speakers' in this House. This is the trouble. If a Member is permitted by the hon. Speaker, there are others who are questioning your authority to call a Member. What is all this?...(*Interruptions*)

श्री विजय गोयल : आप हमेशा हमारे ऊपर कमैन्ट्स करते हैंâ€¦(व्यवधान) यह गलत बात हैâ€¦(व्यवधान) क्या इन्होंने बोलने के लिए नोटिस दिया है।â€¦(व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: There is a tradition in the House that whenever a senior Member speaks, you have to respect him. What is this?

...(*Interruptions*)

श्री विजय गोयल : इन्हें कहिये कमेन्ट पास न करेंâ€¦(व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: You have to follow the traditions also.

...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA : Sir, no leader from that side will be allowed to speak...(*Interruptions*)

श्री रघुनाथ झा (गोपालगंज) : अध्यक्ष महोदय, उन्होंने तो रूल दिखा दिया, लेकिन जो सीनियर मैम्बर्स हैं क्या उनके लिए कोई रूल है। एकदम से बोलने के लिए खड़े हो जाते हैंâ€¦(व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: I am appealing the senior Members also to understand the anguish, anger, and agony of the junior Members.

...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE : Sir, a question has been raised as to the procedure for the appointment to the important positions in important public sector undertakings. Sir, whether some hon. Member has said something or not, it has a bearing on this. The answer can be given not by the hon. Member in his private capacity but by the hon. Minister of Finance or by someone on behalf of the Government. Therefore, Rule 40 has no relevance here. Sir, it is because it was said that the name was noted down on a piece of paper and sent to the Prime Minister and on that basis, the appointment had been made. Therefore, this is a matter which has to be clarified. This is not an individual matter or the individual statement made outside. It cannot be just thwarted down in this fashion...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI T.M. SELVAGANPATHI (SALEM): Sir, the Minister of Finance made a statement in the Rajya Sabha in this regard...(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Nothing will go on record.

*(Interruptions)**

MR. SPEAKER: Anything from the Government's side.

....(*Interruptions*)

* Not Recorded

MR. SPEAKER: Nothing will go on record.

(Interruptions) *

MR. SPEAKER: Is there anything from the Government""s side?

...(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Nothing is going on record.

(Interruptions) *

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Sir, a reference was made to the other House. In the other House I was responding to a specific question during the Question Hour.

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA : This is also a specific question.

SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN: But this is not Question Hour.

MR. SPEAKER: This is the problem always, Shri Basu Deb Acharia. You are raising a matter and you are not willing to hear anything from the Minister.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: This matter has been raised here.

SHRI S. BANGARAPPA (SHIMOGA): I have a point to make.

MR. SPEAKER: Shri Bangarappa, please take your seat. I have not called you to speak. Only the Minister""s intervention will go on record. You are not allowing the Minister to speak after asking him a question.

...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN: Nothing of this should go on record, Sir.

MR. SPEAKER: I have already said that.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Here it has been raised suddenly during ""Zero Hour"". It is not necessary for the

Government to respond immediately to all issues during `Zero Hour"". This is an accepted practice of this House. ...(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Shri PANDIAN, this is too much.

* Not Recorded

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: But, in view of the fact that we are interested in going ahead with the business of the House and the Government does not want to create any problems, I would only say from my side that I have checked up my records; we have followed the full procedure of the Appointments Committee of the Cabinet in this regard.

SHRI P.H. PANDIAN : What is the procedure? ...(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Nothing will go on record.

*(Interruptions)**